

Reflection Levels of Values to Be Gained Explicitly in Secondary Schools on Textbooks

Tekin Çelikkaya [1], Uğur Başarmak [2], Simge Filoğlu [3], Bilge Şahin [4]

[1] Ahi Evran University,
Education Faculty ,Kırşehir,
Turkey,
tcelikkaya@ahievran.edu

[2] Ahi Evran University,
Education Faculty
,Kırşehir,Turkey,
ugurbasarmak@gmail.com

[3] Ahi Evran University,
Education Faculty,
Kırşehir,Turkey,
simgefiloglu@hotmail.com

[4] Vali Mithat Elementary
School, Kırşehir,Turkey,
bilgegomcu2008@hotmail.com

ABSTRACT

Which values take place, how much space the values cover, which ones are emphasised more frequently are of capital importance in Social Studies textbooks. This study which was conducted to determine the place of values in secondary school social studies textbooks was carried out by document analysis, one of the qualitative research techniques. The latest publications of secondary school social studies guide books for teachers belonging to both Meb and private publishing houses were analysed in the research. The data collected from the books were analysed under 7 themes and 26 sub-themes and the findings belonging to the themes were presented in the tables and finally the sub-themes belonging to these themes were given as an explanation under the tables. While values of responsibility, cooperation, aesthetic, being scientific, sensitivity to cultural heritage, respect to rights and freedoms are included adequately, it can be stated that values of helping each other, hardworking, and sensitivity to natural environment, patriotism, honesty, being fair, respect to flag and the Turkish National Anthem, and peace are not included sufficiently. In terms of publishing houses, it can be stated that Meb publications are more efficient with regards to including knowledge related to values and values education in every class level and teaching values.

Keywords: *Secondary school, Social studies textbooks, values, reflection level*

INTRODUCTION

The states actualize their continuity and development, and carry on their customs and traditions via education system. In other words, they transfer their values via education system. One of the most important duties in this transfer belongs to the elementary schools and elementary schools serve this purpose with all their bodies. The people who pave the way for the transfer of values in elementary school curriculum are teachers. Elementary school curricula which guide the teachers in this process and the textbooks which provide the content suitable to the purpose of the curricula form one of the most important elements of this transfer (Sezer, 2005,p.2-3).

The main purpose of the schools is not only to raise individuals who are academically successful but also have them gain the basic values. In order to realize this purpose, the textbooks play an important role as well as the factors such as teachers, family, and environment because a student spends a considerable amount of time with his course book in school. According to a research conducted by Shannon (1982), the students spend between %70 and %95 of their time with activities relying on their textbooks in class environment. (Direct by: Ho and Hsu, 2011,p.93). It was determined with the studies conducted by Adıgüzel (2010) and Karaca (2011) in Turkey that the teachers usually use textbooks which are the main teaching tools and instruments.

The children in the world are increasingly affected by the growing social problems, violence and intolerance. Families and educators in many countries put emphasis on effective values education to get rid of these problems which threaten the social order (Tillman,2000,p.IX). Course books take an important place besides preparing an

effective curriculum for the values to be gained. Sanchez (1998,p.5) suggests that existence of one dimensional, traditional and randomly chosen reading texts in textbooks bring up the use of stories to choose the heroes and reveal their qualities. The textbooks studied in elementary and secondary schools can not enable the students to gain the desired values because they rarely tell all the qualities of the heroes (in terms of individual and cultural reflections).

Course books are the basic materials of education activities in schools. While the elementary school curriculum was renewed, the work book which covered the course book and the activities which included the gains was being prepared, guide book for teachers had been prepared for the teachers to help them during the lesson. "Guide Book for Teachers " not only guides the teachers about how to structure knowledge in the lesson and leads them to follow the way during the process but also it shows the students the gains, skills and values they have to acquire in the lesson. The values which are planned to be transferred directly in secondary school social studies curriculum are tried to be gained via texts, knowledge, pictures, photographs, proverbs, sayings, dialogues, cartoons, poems, heroes, stories, activities and evaluation questions.

Definition of value obtained from Özgüven (1999) takes place in Elementary Social Studies Curriculum. According to this definition, values "are the common ideas, purposes, basic moral principles or beliefs accepted as right and essential by most of the members of a social group or society to sustain and provide their existence, unity, functioning and continuance."(MEB, 2005, p.89). The teachers who are the practitioners of teaching programs play an active role in the transfer of values. There are various methods and techniques used by the teachers while teaching values. The most common ones are discussion based approach and student centred active teaching strategies. The other methods used in values education include drama, project work, applied activities, collaborative learning and group work, researches conducted by the students, educational games and entertainment days (Halstead,1996, p.11) The methods and techniques used by the teacher while teaching the course can help the students to internalize the desired values.

Social Studies is a value education course. One of the points which drew attention during the radical curriculum changes actualized in 2004 is that subject of values education is emphasised within the curricula. When Social Studies Teaching Curriculum is analysed, 20 values are aimed to be taught to the students (MEB, 2008; MEB, 2010). These values are determined to be "*Being fair, Giving importance to family values, Peace, Independence, Being scientific, Hardworking, Cooperation, Sensitivity, Honesty, Aesthetic, Tolerance, Hospitality, Freedom, Respect, Giving importance to being healthy, Love, Responsibility, Cleanliness, Patriotism, and Helpfulness.*" While some of these values are taught only in one class level (for ex: hospitality in the 4th grade, aesthetic in the 7th grade), some of them are taught at the same time in some class levels (for ex: respect in the 4th, 5th, 6th and 7th grades).

Which values take place, how much space the values cover, which ones are emphasised more frequently in the textbooks which are used by the students and the teachers as the primary source in Social Studies course is of vital importance. Therefore, it was intended in the study to determine the status of giving place to values in the 5th, 6th and 7th grades of secondary school Social Studies textbooks. The questions given below were sought answers in line with this purpose.

1. In which form (visual, knowledge, activity, news, expression, evaluation and so on) and how often the values to be gained directly are included in the 5th, 6th, and 7th grades of secondary school Social Studies textbooks printed by MEB and private publishing houses?
2. Which values are given more space in the 5th, 6th, and 7th grades of secondary school Social Studies textbooks printed by MEB and private publishing houses?

RESEARCH MODEL

The research, which was conducted to determine the status of giving place to values in the 5th, 6th and 7th grades of secondary school Social Studies textbooks, was carried out by document analysis, one of the qualitative research methods. Inductive analysis was used for the analysis of data. Document analysis involves the analysis of written materials which include information about a fact or facts which are intended to be examined (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2003,p.140).

Population and Sample

The latest publications of the 5th, 6th, and 7th grades of secondary school Social Studies Guide Book for Teachers by both Meb and private publishing houses were considered to be examined in this research. .

In the research, 5th, 6th and 7th grades of secondary school Social Studies Guide Book for Teachers was used according to the resolution of the Board of Education.

- ✓ 5th grade private publishing house (Pasifik Publishing) .According to the resolution of the Board of Education of Ministry of Education, dated 18.12.2011, numbered 244 ; and 5th grade MEB publication guide book for teachers. According to the resolution of the Board of Education of Ministry of Education, dated 18.12.2009, numbered 290;
- ✓ 6th grade private publishing house (Altın Publishing) According to the resolution of the Board of Education of Ministry of Education, dated 28.06.2006, numbered 294; and 6th grade MEB publication guide book for teachers. According to the resolution of the Board of Education of Ministry of Education, dated 17.12.2010, numbered 239;
- ✓ 7th grade private publishing (Anittepe Publishing) According to the resolution of the Board of Education of Ministry of Education, dated 20.12.2009, numbered 309 ;and 7th grade MEB publication guide book for teachers. According to the resolution of the Board of Education of Ministry of Education, dated 08.12.2011, numbered 258.

DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSYIS

The research data was collected by document analysis, one of qualitative research methods. In this sense, the analysis was carried out over the 5th, 6th, and 7th grades of secondary school Social Studies Guide Book for Teachers printed by Ministry of Education (MEB) and private publishing houses and also both student's book and student's workbook included in the guide book were also examined. The findings were comprised of the data included in this book. The examples given include the entire content of guide book, textbook and workbook. For example, one of the data belonging to the value of "Respect to Rights and Freedoms" is on page 193 in guide book, 159 in textbook and 109 in student's workbook. Because page numbers are different in each book, the page numbers of sample quotes presented in relation to the data obtained point the place they appear in guide book for teachers. The researchers coded separately in the books and consistency ratio was calculated by comparing the coding. In order to determine the reliability in content analysis, the consistency between the coders is calculated. Agreement percentage formula was used in this study for that purpose (Türnüklü,2000,p.551). By using this formula in the study, agreement percentage in coding was calculated to be 0,87 for the 5th grade private publishing house;0,88 for the 5th grade meb publication;0,93 for the 6th grade private publishing house; 0,90 for the 6th grade meb publication; 0,88 for the 7th grade private publishing house and 0,96 for the 7th grade meb publication. Reliability was obtained in terms of data analysis since %70 or above for agreement percentage is considered to be satisfying. The data collected from the books were examined under 7 themes and 26 sub-themes as presented in Table 1 and the findings related to the themes were presented in the tables and the sub-themes belonging to the themes were given below the tables as explanations.

Table 1. Themes and Sub-themes used in the analysis of data

Themes	Sub-themes
VISUAL	Pictures, photos, cartoons, poster, diagram
KNOWLEDGE	Dialogue, explanation, guide book knowledge, poem, folk song, march
CASE STUDY	Story, epic, inscription, case study,
QUOTES	Idiom, proverb, saying
ACTIVITY	Lead-in questions for the subject, questions about the subject, questions and activities in student's book, questions and activities in guide book for teachers
NEWS	Newspaper, Internet and news from magazines
EVALUATION	End of unit evaluation questions

FINDINGS

The findings obtained in the study which examined the reflection levels of values to be gained explicitly in secondary schools on textbooks were presented in tables.

Findings Related To the 5th Grade Social Studies Textbooks

Table 2. Findings Related to Reflection Levels of Values which are going to be gained explicitly in the 5th Grade Social Studies Textbooks of MEB Publication and Private Publishing houses

THEMES	VISUAL		KNOWLEDGE		CASE		EXPRESSION		ACTIVITY		NEWS		EVALUATION	
	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE
Publishing house														
Value														
Responsibility	8	24	24	64	2	2	-	-	14	59	2	-	8	11
Aesthetic	48	72	23	17	-	-	-	-	-	21	2	-	10	1
Sensitivity to Natural Environment	3	-	3	3	1	-	-	-	2	-	2	3	-	-
Hardworking	11	6	15	2	1	1	-	-	4	2	4	2	2	-
Academic Honesty	4	-	20	3	-	-	-	-	3	1	-	-	2	1
Cooperation	20	23	23	18	2	1	-	2	13	14	8	4	10	15
Being fair, Respect to Flag and the National Anthem	3	-	10	11	-	-	1	-	14	-	-	-	7	-
Sensitivity to Historical Heritage	17	24	6	5	-	-	-	-	8	-	4	-	3	1

Responsibility value was included in **MEB** publication with the photographs which showed that the students fulfilled their responsibilities (8) in **visual** theme; with knowledge such as explanation(13), guide book for teachers (2), dialogue (9) in **knowledge** theme, with examples such as “...everybody fulfils their own duty...(p.78);...they have to fulfil their responsibilities towards the environment. (p.87); it is our responsibility to continue our primary education (p.90)” ; with case studies such as a day in life of Ayşe (1) and an invitation to anybody (1) in **case** theme ; with lead-in questions for the subject (2), questions about the subject(6) , questions and activities in student’s workbook in **activity** theme with examples such as “What are your rights and responsibilities in your school? (p.84);Specify which expressions that are put in Ayşe’s list are the rights or the responsibilities.(p.85)” ; with true-false questions (1), fill in the gaps (2), multiple choice questions (5) in **evaluation** theme with examples such as “ every role that is undertaken requires some rights and responsibilities if they weren’t...(p.92)”. **Responsibility** value was included in **private** publishing house with knowledge related to responsibility with both photographs (13) and pictures (11) in **visual** theme; explanation of responsibilities towards the school, environment, family and state by the students (10), guide book for teachers (37), dialogue (17) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “...specify the duties of the children such as doing their homework, cleaning their rooms and so on. (p.59); fulfilling individual responsibilities...(p.63); responsibilities for our country ...(p.66); these are our responsibilities in our school(p.67); case studies related to individual’s not being able to fulfil his duty (1) or being able to fulfil his duty (1)in **case** theme; lead-in questions for the subject (4), questions about the subject(36) , homework in student’s workbook (18) and project works (1) in **activity** theme with examples such as “... state the responsibilities brought by the roles... (p.54)”; multiple choice questions(2), true-false (1), matching (7) and essay type question (1) in **evaluation** theme with an example such as “... match the relevant rights and freedom (p.73).

Aesthetic value was included in **Meb** publication with map (1), historical artefacts (14), natural beauty (10), photographs of cultural richness (such as clothes, folk dances, handicrafts, anecdotes) (23) in **visual** theme; explanations(12), dialogues(7), guide book for teachers (4) in **knowledge** theme with an example such as “...underline that our handicrafts carry aesthetic value, each of them is elegant, detailed, refined and motifs have different meanings (p.104); internet news related to natural beauty (1) and cultural richness in **news** theme; true-false questions (1), essay type questions (4), multiple choice questions (5) in **evaluation** theme. In **private** publishing house, historical artefacts (23), natural beauties (12), photographs belonging to cultural richness (such as clothes, food, folk song, handicrafts, religious festivals and weddings) (37) in **visual** theme; an explanation (1) given about the beauty of the artefacts, their uniqueness, gracefulness, dialogue (15), guide book for teachers (1) in **knowledge** theme; lead-in questions for the subject (2), questions about the subject(10), questions and activities in student’s workbook (9) in **activity** theme; and only a true-false question (1) in **evaluation** theme were included.

Value of **sensitivity to natural environment** was included in **Meb** publication with the photographs of newspaper news and activities given in the study (3) in **visual** theme; explanations (3) in **knowledge** theme with an example such as “...this will be actualized by the help of people who are sensitive about the natural environment. (p.135); case studies in workbook (1) in **case** theme; questions and activities about the subject (1) and in student’s workbook (1) in **activity** theme with examples such as “what can be done to prevent environmental pollution and to reduce the harm given to the environment by the people?(p.135); why do we have to be sensitive about the protection of natural environment? (p.135)”; and internet (1) and newspaper (1) news in **news** theme. In **private** publishing house, information of explanations (2) and guide book for teachers (1) in **knowledge** theme with an example such as “... not damaging the natural balance... (p.125)”; and internet news (3) in **case** theme were included.

Value of **hardworking** was included in **Meb** publication with the photographs of working and producing people (11) in **visual** theme; explanations expressing the professions and productions of the people (6) and dialogues (9) in **knowledge** theme with an example such as “...we work in the coal mines... make great effort... with the effort of the labourers it becomes steel.(p.149)”; case study which the students tell their experiences in a project work (1) in **case** theme; questions and activities about the subject (2), guide book for teachers (1) in **activity** theme; internet (3) and newspaper news (1) in **news** theme; essay type questions (2) in **evaluation** theme with an example such as “how does being hardworking and **entrepreneur** contribute to economy?(p.167)”. In **private** publishing house, pictures of successful people (4), pictures related to productivity (1) and **entrepreneurship** diagram (1) in **visual** theme; dialogues (2) in **knowledge** theme; case studies about how a housewife becomes successful (1) in **case** theme; questions about the subject (1), questions and activities in student’s workbook in **activity** theme and internet news about successful working (1) and **entrepreneurship** (1) were included.

Value of **academic honesty** was included in **Meb** publications with photographs showing the students’ study conditions and how they do research (4) in **visual** theme; explanations which tell the ways about how to do scientific research in the last subject of the unit called “Our Information Sources” (20) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “...he made a plan. (p.184); to collect information about my research topic... (p.185); ...I especially wrote from which sources I obtained information p.185.” questions and activities about the subject (1) and in student’s workbook in **activity** theme with examples such as “why is it important to give reference in the researches, do you think? p.185; we must benefit from the right sources while doing a research about a topic because (p.185)”; and an essay type question (1) and multiple choice question (1) in **evaluation** theme with examples such as “Which rules must be obeyed while doing a research about a topic? Why? (p.187)”. In **private** publishing house, explanations (2) and information in guide book for teachers (1) in **knowledge** theme with an example such as “... specify the sources you used as given below.(p.191)”expression which only takes place in self evaluation form in student’s workbook (1) in **activity** theme with an example such as “ I can show the sources I benefited from in the researches I conducted. (p.193)”; true-false questions (1) and “Doing research is academic honesty (p.192)” in **evaluation** theme were included.

Value of **cooperation** was included in **Meb** publications with photographs (16) and posters (4) in **visual** theme; explanations (19), guide book for teachers (3) and poems in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “...mention briefly the importance of helping each other and cooperation. (p.198); some non-governmental organization were founded to protect the rights of the children and to prepare them for the future.(p.197);... the people who are active citizens give importance to helping each other and cooperation .(p.205)”; case studies related to a visit to Otash Camp and meeting students’ expenses (2) in **case**; lead-in questions (5), questions and activities about the subject (5) and in student’s workbook (5) in **activity** theme; internet (3) and newspaper (5) news showing the activities of non-governmental organizations in **news** theme; true-false question(1), fill in the gaps (1), concept map(1), essay type questions (5) in **evaluation** theme. In **private** publishing house, photographs showing the activities of governmental and non-governmental organizations (23) in **visual** theme; explanations (14), dialogues (3), and poems (1) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “ We help each other in order to meet our need as an individual

(p.198);...gave a lending help to children p.200"; case study which tells the aid of the hospital workers for LÖSEV (1) in **case** theme; with a quote of Mevlana in student's workbook which is "A candle loses nothing by lighting another candle"(1) and with "Two heads are better than one .(p.214)" proverb which is an answer to a multiple choice question asked in evaluation question (1) in **expression** theme ; questions and activities about subject (7) and in student's workbook (6), project work (1) in **activity** theme with examples such as "paste the news about Turkish Red Crescent which runs for the help of people during the natural disasters in newspapers in the blank space given below .(p.206); What can you do to contribute to the works done by LÖSEV?(p.208)" ; Internet news showing aid activities not only by governmental and non-governmental organizations but also by individuals (4) in **news** theme ; multiple –choice test questions (3), fill in the gaps questions (5), true-false questions (6), concept puzzle questions (2) in **evaluation** theme were included.

Values of **being fair, respect to the flag and the Turkish National Anthem** were included in **Meb** publication with photographs reflecting respect to the flag and the Turkish national anthem (3) in **visual** theme; explanations (6), poem (1), march and (1) guide book for teachers (2) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as " this is your most fundamental right ... (p.210); Emphasise that the meaning and importance of flag is great to Turkish nation (p.223); ... M. Akif Ersoy's patriotism, love of independence, love and respect to the ... (p.225)" ; a quote of Atatürk which is (1) "Justice is granted with laws. (p.210)" ; questions and activities about the subject (4), in guide book for teachers (1) and student's workbook (9) with examples especially about the administrator's being just such as " What would be experienced if a governor or a district governor were not just with his decisions or activities? (p.221) and ... if you were to govern, what would you do as a just administrator? (p.221)" in **expression** theme ; fill in the gaps (2), essay type questions (2), multiple choice (3) questions in **evaluation** theme. In **private** publication, being fair theme with dialogues (3), explanations (7) and poem (1) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as "... protect the rights of the citizens (p.232); Ministry of Justice ... fulfils their duty .(p.233)"; respect to the flag with "a law passed on Turkish flag on May 29 ,1936 (p.236)" were included.

Value of **sensitivity to historical heritage** was included in **Meb** publications with photographs of historical artefacts (17) in **visual** theme, explanations (4) and information from guide book for teachers (2) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as " Tell our students that historical artefacts, natural beauty and etc given as examples were all components of common heritage (p.240); ...must be sensitive about conservation of historical heritage and their being reintegrated into tourism. (P.245)" ; lead –in questions (1), questions about the subjects (3) and questions and activities in student's workbook (2) in **activity** theme with examples such as "... historical artefacts and natural beauties are present . Why is it important to protect them? (p.240); ... What could you do for the conservation of natural and cultural heritages?(p.241)"; Internet (3) and newspaper news (1) in **news** theme; essay type questions (1), multiple choice questions (2) in **evaluation** theme. In **private** publishing houses, photographs of historical artefacts (24) in **visual** theme; explanation (1) and information from guide book for teachers (4) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as "Emphasise that the purpose of UNESCO is to protect world heritages and transfer to the next generations .(p.252) ; true-false question (1) in **evaluation** theme with an example such as " Ministry of Culture enables the protection of historical artefacts in our country. (p.261)".

Findings Related To the 6th Grade Social Studies TextbooksTable 3. Findings Related to Reflection Levels of Values which are going to be gained explicitly in the 6th Grade Social Studies Textbooks of Meb Publication and Private Publishing Houses

THEMES	VISUAL		KNOWLEDGE		CASE		EXPRESSION		ACTIVITY		NEWS		EVALUATION	
	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE
Publishing house														
Value														
Being Scientific	5	3	13	25	-	-	3	1	10	20	-	-	6	6
Sensitivity to Natural Environment	-	5	2	6	-	-	-	-	1	8	-	1	-	-
Sensitivity to Cultural Heritage	8	29	20	31	-	-	-	-	10	12	1	1	2	6
Responsibility	6	1	6	1	-	1	-	1	4	2	1	-	1	2
Being Helpful	3	3	4	1	-	2	1	-	3	7	-	1	1	1
Respect to Rights and Freedom	6	7	46	41	-	1	5	-	22	28	6	2	5	14
Hardworking	4	-	1	-	-	2	1	-	-	4	14	4	-	2

Value of *being scientific* was included in **Meb** publications with the photographs showing that students do research (5) in **visual** theme; explanation firstly beginning with the fact and opinion concepts and then including the steps of scientific research (10); and information from guide book for teachers (3) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “*Apart from our own opinions, we can also use the expressions whose truth can be proved scientifically in our daily life. (p.52); the teachers informed them about the scientific research steps. (p.64)*”; quotes of Atatürk (3) in **expression** theme with examples such as “*... their conservation and classification scientifically... (p.62)*” ; lead –in questions (1), questions about the subject (3) and questions and activities in guide books for teachers (5) in **activity** theme with an example such as “*Why is it important to apply the scientific research steps while doing research? (p.64)*”; essay type questions (3), multiple choice questions (3) in **evaluation** theme. In **private** publishing house, photographs from library and search catalogue (3) in **visual** theme explanation (21), information from guide book for teachers (4) in **knowledge** theme with an example such as “*...citing somebody’s information without adding footnotes won’t be accorded with being scientific ... (p.28)*”; quote of Atatürk (1) in **expression** theme ; lead –in questions (3), questions about the subject (9) and questions and activities in guide books for teachers (1) and student’s workbook (7) in **activity** theme with examples such as “*Do a research on any subject you want or wonder by using the scientific research steps. (p.43)*” ; matching (1), multiple choice questions(2) and essay type questions in **evaluation** theme with examples such as “*which scientific research step is not mentioned in this talk?(p.67)*” were included.

Value of *sensitivity to natural environment* was included in **Meb** publications with only explanations (2) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “*unconsciousness in the countries where there are rain forests and the timber demands of developed countries cause the destruction to increase (p.76); but due to much lumbering, teak trees and our forest are in danger of extinction. (p.77)*”; with a question “*In your opinion, what can be done to stop this extinction?(p.76)*” about the subject which is asked following the informative explanations (1) in **activity** theme.. In **private** publishing house, photographs showing the endangered animals (3) and the destruction of forest (2) in **visual** theme, explanation (5) and information from guide book for teachers (1) in **knowledge** theme with an example such as “*you can bring stories related to the subject as this part of the unit is allowed for the value of sensitivity to natural environment. (p.74)*”; lead-in questions (1), questions about the topic (3), questions and activities in student’s workbook (4) in **activity** theme with examples such as “*in your opinion, what should be done to protect the forest?(p.74); an activity called let’s give them a right to live (p.83)*” and Internet news about threat to natural environment and the precautions taken(1) in **news** theme were included.

Value of *sensitivity to cultural heritage* was included in **Meb** publications with pictures (4), miniature (3) and photographs(1) showing manners, customs and traditions in **visual** theme ; epics, books, inscriptions and

explanations about the life of scholars and statesmen and manners, customs and traditions (15), information from guide book for teachers (4) and dialogues (1) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “*Turkey who gives importance to the conservation of cultural heritage ... (p.103); the artefacts belonging to Gokturks were uncovered with the effort of The Turkish International Cooperation and Development Agency (TİKA) were started to be exhibited in museums... (p.103); one of our components is the weddings. (p.127); ... state that our country contributes to the conservation of cultural heritage in that way. (p.130)*”; lead-in questions (1), questions and activities in guide book for teachers (2) and student’s workbook (7) in **activity** theme with examples such as “*which handicrafts have survived in our day? (p.131)*”; news in newspaper about the activities of the Newroz Festival (1) in **news** theme; true-false questions (1) and essay type questions (1) in **evaluation** theme. In **private** publishing house, photographs showing historical artefacts (9), miniature and pictures (11), cultural richness (9) in **visual** theme; epics (3) and inscriptions (1) in **case** theme; explanations belonging to our cultural richness and the works of art left behind the scientists and statesmen (31) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “*...Celebrations such as Festivals, Newroz celebrations, weddings and mesir paste festival are the indicators of our cultural richness. These are our values which compose, develop and keep our culture alive via language, religion, music, and literature. (p.116)*”; lead –in questions (2), questions about the subject (5) and questions and activities in student’s workbook in **activity** theme with examples such as “*What is the place of festivals, ceremonies and celebrations in Turkish culture ? (p.113); What are the contributions of artefacts survived from the Seljuk Period to Turkish sense of culture, art and aesthetic? (p.130)*” Internet news showing the cultural richness (1) in **news** theme ; true-false questions (1), matching (1), multiple choice questions (2) and essay type questions in **evaluation** theme were included.

Value of **responsibility** was included in **Meb** publication with posters about paying tax(6) in **visual** theme ; an explanation about paying tax as a responsibility of a citizen(5) and a poem (1) in **knowledge** theme with an example such as “*It defends the importance and attention to paying tax in terms of its contribution to civic responsibility and national economy. (p.148)* ; a short story in student’s workbook (1) in **case** theme; questions activities about subject (1) and in student’s workbook (3) in **activity** theme with examples such as “*Why does Ataturk give importance to the civic duty? (p.149); As a civic responsibility ... (p.149)*”; newspaper news about paying tax (1) in **news** theme; and only (1) multiple choice question is **evaluation** theme. In **private** publishing house, a cartoon story which tells the importance of paying taxes as a civic responsibility (1) in **visual** theme ; apart from the information given in visual theme explanation only (1) in **knowledge** theme with an example such as “*...we are required to review our approach to the environment and natural resources again. (p.151)*”; case study which mentions the responsibility of two students while doing homework assigned to them in **case** theme; quote of Ataturk which is “*the one who loves his country is the one who performs his duties in the best way. (p.149) (1)*” in **expression** theme ; questions about the subject (1) , homework which asks the students to prepare a poster about the responsibility for paying tax (1) in **activity** theme; matching (1) and multiple choice questions (1) in **evaluation** theme were included.

Value of **helpfulness** was included in **Meb** publications with newspaper news and photographs in the student’s workbook (3) in **visual** theme; explanations about helpfulness and cooperation (3) and a poem (1) in **knowledge** theme; a proverb saying “*United we stand divided we fall. (p.176)(1)*” in **expression** theme; questions about the subject (2) and activities in student’s workbook (1) in **activity** theme ; multiple choice question type (1) in **evaluation** theme. In **private** publishing house, photographs in case study (3) in **visual** theme ; apart from the explanations that take place in case study with the gain (1) called “*Realizes the importance of our country being in cooperation and solidarity about natural disasters and environmental problems with other countries. (p.180)*” under the topic called only difficulties are resolved together in **knowledge** theme; case study which tells the hand given to a student after an earthquake he lived through (1) and a short story in student’s workbook (1) in **case** theme ; lead –in questions (1), questions about the subject (2) and in guide book for teachers (2) and student’s workbook (2) in **activity** theme with examples such as “*Why are international cooperation and solidarity important in the face of natural disasters and environmental problems? (p.181)*” ; newspaper news (1) in **news** theme; essay question type such as “*What do you feel when you see people anywhere in the world who are powerless in the face of natural disaster or an environmental problem ? If you were asked to create a solution to prevent people from living through such problems, what kind of solution would you think? (p.187)*” in **evaluation** theme were included.

Value of **respect to rights and freedom** was included in **Meb** publications with diagram showing rights and freedom (1) and photographs showing the rights given to the women (5) in **visual** theme; dialogues (2), explanations (37), information from guide book for teachers (7) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “*...State that one of the most fundamental features of Turkish Republic is to respect human rights and to be a secular state. (p.192)*”; quote of Mohammed The Prophet which is “*You have got rights over the women and they have got rights over you. (p.192)*” (1) and quotes of Ataturk which are “*...shortly the rights, interests, and freedom of a citizen working in any social institution are equal. (p.199); ...without discriminating they can benefit from any rights and freedom announced with this.. (p.198); Republican administration parts from the other regime due to value it gives to human beings, and*

respect it shows to human rights and freedom.(p.199) ” in **expression** theme ; lead-in questions (2) , questions about the subject (9), questions and activities in guide book for teachers (3) and student’s workbook (8) in **activity** theme with an example such as “What are the rights and freedom Mustafa Kemal Atatürk introduced with the Republic?(p.199)” ; Internet (2) and newspaper news (4) in **news** theme ; true-false questions (2), and multiple choice questions (3) in **evaluation** theme. In **private** publishing house, photographs related to human rights to life, education, and care (5), picture (1) and cartoons (1) in **visual** theme; explanations which cite the reflections of rights given to human beings and even animals from past to present (41) by discussing the concept of right in history in **knowledge** theme with examples giving historical texts such as “ the codes of Hammurabi, last speech, Magna Carta and the laws of Suleyman the Magnificent , Declaration of Human Rights in 1789, the Ottoman Basic Law, Universal Declaration of Human Rights in1948 and European Court of Human Rights(p.210-214)” ; a play which is about a person who feels he has been treated unfairly and how injustice against him was rectified (1) in **case** theme ; lead-in questions (7) , questions about the subject (10), questions and activities in guide book for teachers (3) and student’s workbook (8) in **activity** theme; newspaper news in (2) **news** theme; true-false questions (3), matching (6), multiple-choice questions (3) and essay type questions in **evaluation** theme were included.

Value of **hardworking** was included in **Meb** publication with photographs showing the products which emerged as a result of hard work and determination (4) in **visual** theme; an explanation which says (1) “...raising hardworking and self sacrificing scientists(p.220)” in **knowledge** theme ; a quote of Ataturk which is “Our true mentor in life is science.(p.220) (1)”in **expression** theme; a magazine covering the products that emerged as a result of hard work and determination (4), newspaper (6) and Internet news (4) in **news** theme. In **private** publishing house, short stories (2) in the textbook called “Dream Thief” and in student’s workbook called “An Unknown History of a Basketball Player” in **case** theme; questions and activities about the subject (1) and in student’s workbook (3)in **activity** theme; magazine news (2) in **news** theme , and true-false questions (2) in **evaluation** theme were included.

Findings Related To the 7th Grade Social Studies Textbooks

Table 4. Findings Related to Reflection Levels of Values which are going to be gained explicitly in the 7th Grade Social Studies Textbooks of Meb Publication and Private Publishing Houses

THEMES	VISUAL		KNOWLEDGE		CASE		EXPRESSION		ACTIVITY		NEWS		EVALUATION	
	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE	MEB	PRIVATE
Publishing house														
Value														
Respect to Discrepancies	2	2	4	4	2	1	1	-	-	4	-	-	1	1
Patriotism	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	-	-	-	-
Aesthetic	81	24	40	24	-	5	-	-	-	2	2	-	1	1
Being Scientific	-	-	8	2	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Honesty	-	-	7	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Being Fair	1	-	20	5	-	-	-	-	2	1	-	-	3	-
Peace	7	-	15	2	-	1	-	-	7	5	4	-	2	-

Value of **respect to differences** was included in **Meb** publications with photographs related to communication topic (2) in **visual** theme ; explanations especially expressing respect to differences of opinion (4) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “When our friends thinks differently from us to show respect (p.74); he tries to understand what the speakers feel and think. (p.76)” ; short stories in guide book for teachers (1) and student’s textbook (1) in **case** theme ; a quote of Ataturk (1) which is “ I appreciate listening to everybody one by one even though I will put into practice my own ideas” (p.86)”in **expression** theme ; multiple-choice question type (1) whose answer is respect to differences(p.89) in **evaluation** theme . In **private** publishing house, pictures (2) in **visual** theme;

explanations (3), information from guide books for teachers in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “*specify what differences there are between the students in the visual. We have all have got different qualities. We must respect these differences. (p.34) and ...showing respect to different opinions ... (p.38)*”; case study called Efe’s diary about the right of privacy topic (1); in **case** theme; lead-in questions (1), questions about the subject (3) in **activity** theme with examples such as “*How does showing respect to differences or not affect communication? (p.34)*”; a critical question (1) in **evaluation** theme with an examples such as “*Deliberately laying hands on the rights and freedom of a person and violating them (p.54)*” were included.

Value of **patriotism** was not included in **Meb** publications in any of the themes. In the units the rights of citizenship was mentioned. In **private** publishing house, a study called what can be done for the future of the country in student’s workbook (2) and a song called “*Memleketim (p.78)*” were included.

Value of **aesthetic** was included in **Meb** publication, with photographs of historical works of art built during the Ottoman Empire (35), miniatures depicting the events (17), photographs showing cultural richness such as clothes, food, and traditions (20) and pictures (9) in **visual** theme; explanations especially in line with the gain “*realizing the effects in the sense of culture, art and aesthetic in the framework of Ottoman-European relations.(p.140)*” citing expressions belonging to works of art and cultural richness such as “*unique example, the best example, reflecting art and aesthetic, compatible*”(40) in **knowledge** theme ; news in the newspaper (2) ;about “*the mosque built without a single nail (Çivisiz Cami) (p.119) and The European composers were affected by the Ottoman Janissary Band (Mehter Takımı) (p.140)*” in **news** theme; and cultural richness with multiple choice question type in **evaluation** theme. In **private** publishing house, photographs of historical artefacts (13), cultural richness (5) and miniature pictures (6) in **visual** theme; explanations (10), quotations (11) and information from guide book for teachers (3) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “*...you can draw the attention on the magnificent stonemasonry (p.86); you can emphasise that classical Turkish houses are both user friendly and they have aesthetic dimension (p.114); The Suleymaniye Mosque With its many technical features, the mosque is beyond the reach (p.118) ” ; epics (2) and short stories (3) in case theme ; questions about the subject (2) in activity theme; research homework (1) in evaluation theme with an example such as “*prepare an information file which reflects the historical and cultural qualities of the city where you live by benefiting from various document. Share the file prepared with your classmates. (p.127) ”* were included.*

Value of being **scientific** was included in **Meb** publication, with giving reference just under the quotations (8) in **knowledge** theme. In **private** publishing houses, explanations (2) such as “*to wonder, to know, and to learn are the most important qualities of humanity (p.142)*” which emphasises science concept in **knowledge** theme were included.

Value of **honesty** was included in **Meb** publication, with explanations where expressions such as honesty, righteousness, being fair were mentioned (7) in **knowledge** theme with examples “*...be as good as your word, ... (p.194); be honest (p.84); tell the truth about everything.* In **private** publishing house, no themes were included.

Value of **being fair** was included in **Meb** publication with photographs showing the inside of courtroom(1); explanations stating how the state, administrators, and judicial bodies secure justice (18) and information from guide book for teachers (2) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “*While Egyptian pharaohs killed people, Turkish emperors only thought the welfare of the nation . (p.204); Divan was open to wishes and complaints of all the public without differentiating between religions and nations. (p.205); everybody had the equal vote right. (p.207)*”; questions and activities in guide book for teachers (1) and student’s workbook (1) in **activity** theme with an examples such as “*How should a class president be chosen? (p.207)*”; and multiple choice questions (3) in **evaluation** theme. In **private** publishing house, explanations (5) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “*There is no discrimination and privilege between the Turkish citizens. (p.193); Judicial bodies of the state are the most authorized institutions in distinguishing just or unjust. (p.197) ; , state provisions not being cruel was mentioned like that“ don’t be cruel; use cruelty against the evil, clear the whole country from the evil (p.185) ” ; activity in student’s workbook (1) in **activity** theme were included.*

Value of **peace** was included in **Meb** publication with photographs showing the destruction caused by the war (1) and cartoons about global issues in student’s workbook (6) in **visual** theme; explanations belonging to peace treaties to stop the wars and protocols and convention (15) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “*...withdrew from the war by the Mondros Armistice Agreement.(p.233), ...Global Environmental Convention was signed by some of the participant countries. (p.239)*” a question about the subject (1), questions and activities in student’s workbook (6) in **activity** theme with examples especially in line with the pictures given in student’s workbook such as ; ... *write a composition about the importance of peace . (p.233); ...write a composition including your opinions about the establishing and protection of peace. (p.241)*”; Internet (3) and newspaper news (1) about the solution of global issues in **news** theme; true-false question (1) and multiple choice question (1) in **evaluation** theme. In **private** publishing

house, explanations (2) in **knowledge** theme with examples such as “... Mustafa Kemal is a unique genius who gave importance to peace at home and in the world. (p.217); If a continuous peace is wanted, international precautions are taken to enhance the conditions of communities. (p.217)”; a short story which tells the contribution provided to peace by Einstein (1) in **case** theme; questions and activities about the subject (2), in guide book for teachers (1) and student’s workbook (2) in **activity** theme with examples such as “... discuss the damage terrorism gives to peace. (p.223), what can be done for peace? (p.219) and ... what can be done to establish world peace? (p.218)” were included.

CONCLUSION

While books published by private publishing houses were studied in some regions by Ministry of Education, books published by Meb were studied in some regions. While knowledge transfer related to values and values education took part in social studies guide book for teachers published in the 5th, 6th and 7th grade guide book for teachers published by meb, only the definition of relevant theme in the 6th grade guide book for teachers in publications of private publishing house was included. This condition is a negative situation for books published by private publishing houses because the information given in this book transfers important knowledge about values and values education to teachers and helps teachers in this process.

In the 5th grade textbooks by meb publication and private publishing house, values of **responsibility and cooperation** were discussed in the best and most efficient way nearly among all themes. Besides the knowledge given, whether this knowledge was acquired or not was tried to be evaluated with the end of unit evaluation questions. When compared to Meb publication, responsibility and cooperation were included better. **Responsibility** was primarily given as duties belonging to the roles the people have. Especially with the subject of **responsibility** (p.62), the responsibilities were given to the students explicitly, and it was determined that the students were required to possess responsibility. Value of **cooperation** was tried to be transferred by telling the activities carried out by the governmental and non-governmental organizations to solve the social and individual problems. In **Meb** publication and private publishing house, aesthetic value was tried to be acquired with natural assets in different places of Turkey, historical places, cultural richness, plays and clothes, houses, food, handicrafts, weddings, national and religious festivals. In the information given, especially aesthetic value was tried to be emphasised with words such as unique, beauty, fascinating, masterpiece, natural wonder, architectural wonder. It can not be stated that value of **sensitivity to natural environment** was not completely included in both of the publications of Meb and private publishing house. In the information it was given to prevent the damage given to the nature but love for nature was not mentioned. While **hardworking** value was given as a work of an occupational group and people’s transformation of their opinions to production, it was not given in desired level in private publishing house but only as one of the qualities of entrepreneurial person. While value of **academic honesty** was tried to be transferred both in visual and knowledge themes by being emphasised in subject of information resources and steps of the research and giving references in the 5th grade meb publication, it was included only as giving reference in private publishing house but the value was not acquired sufficiently. While values of **being fair and respect to flag and the Turkish National Anthem** was included in the 5th grade meb publication with questions related to the administrator’s being fair or not, respect to flag and the Turkish National Anthem was given with both activities and poems and marches. However, these values were not included in a private publishing house apart from knowledge theme. Value of **sensitivity to historical heritage** was not included in meb publication with any activity in the name of why the historical artefacts whose pictures were given should be protected, by introducing the historical artefacts and objects in private publishing house, their conservation and transfer to future generation was emphasised. It was mentioned that the conservation and completion of these artefacts would contribute to tourism and returns to national economy.

While in the 6th grade Meb publication, value of **being scientific** was included with both visual and informative knowledge by telling students about how a scientific research should be done, it was given as theoretical knowledge only in private publishing house. It can be stated that value of being scientific was included most explicitly and clearly in Meb publication. Both publishing houses tried to teach the value of **sensitivity to natural environment** under very few themes by presenting the negative situations taking place in the nature and their effects. Moreover, as it is expressed in the definition of value, while this value was being acquired, love for nature was not included among the gains. It can be stated that both publishing houses were insufficient to transfer the value. Value of **sensitivity to cultural heritage** was included in both publishing houses with activities related to nearly each theme under the title of celebrations of our living cultural values subject besides the expression of conservation of cultural heritage. Because value of **responsibility** was included in both publishing houses in the best way, the necessity of paying tax as a civic responsibility was emphasised in the 6th grade. Value of **helpfulness** was given efficiently in the 5th grade as value of cooperation in both publishing houses. This value was included in the 6th grade like that: the other countries are required to help the country that lived through a disaster mainly financially according to the relationships between

the countries. Although the expression in the 6th grade Meb publication (2012a,p.35) which said “ *Value of helpfulness should not be regarded as only financially. Sometimes sharing sorrow with a statement, listening to a problem, and giving hope are the expressions of being helpful. Therefore, being rich is not required to help*” were mentioned, helpfulness was only given as materiality. This condition reveals that value of helpfulness was not taught completely in social studies curriculum. **Respect to rights and freedoms** was taught generally in both publishing houses as the historical development of respect to rights and freedoms and the concept of respect was included especially as respect to different beliefs and culture. Moreover, giving the rights which people deserved was expressed as the respect to rights and freedoms. The maximum evaluation questions (Meb,5;Özel,p.14) were included in this values. Value of **hardworking** was tried to be acquired in both publishing houses by emphasising that the organized and disciplined works of the people had a role resulting in the latest technological developments in the science world. In addition to this, it is emphasized with *Dream Thief (p.174)* and *An Unknown History of a Basketball Player (p.247-248)* in private publishing house that to pull off requires to work very hard without giving up and to be determined.

It can not be stated that the values were included completely in the 7th grade books like in the 5th and 6th grades. While both of the publishing houses emphasized value of **aesthetic** most in the 7th grade social studies textbooks, initially **patriotism** which can involve the national feelings being inspired and many values and values of **being scientific** and **honesty** were nearly avoided. Value of **respect to differences** was tried to be taught especially with communication subject in both publishing houses. It can be said that this value was not included adequately. Value of **aesthetic** was tried to be taught with the attainment “*the Ottoman notices the collaboration in the sense of culture, art and aesthetic within the framework of her relationship with Europe*”. While value of **honesty** was not included in private publishing house, it was mentioned with a few sentences about Ahi order and occupational ethics in meb publication. While value of **being fair** was included with informative explanations about the state’s and the administrators’ sense of justice in old Turkish states and the current Turkish Republic in meb publication, it was tried to be explained with the judicial sentences in the constitution and the presence of the courts in private publishing house. Value of **peace** was tried to be taught by giving the war and the bad results caused by the war in both publishing houses. The activities which was included in the expressions “*The ways to establish a positive communication to develop the relationships between the people and the countries must be sought. Art, sports, and cultural activities will help the people to get to know each other better and develop their friendship. Therefore, peace environment will be set up.*” were not included in the 7th grade meb publication ((2012,p.30) for value of peace.

As a result, while values of responsibility, cooperation, aesthetic, being scientific, sensitivity to cultural heritage, respect to rights and freedoms were taught in a better way, it cannot be stated that values of helpfulness, hardworking, sensitivity to natural environment, patriotism, being fair, respect to flag and the National Anthem, and peace were taught adequately. In terms of publishing house, it can be stated that Meb publications were more effective with regards to including information related to value and value education in each class level and teaching the values.

SUGGESTIONS

- ✓ Giving importance to education rather than teaching, especially value education while raising the future generations who are the future of a country can be evaluated as a good development. It is not enough to write the names of the values in Social Studies Curriculum. Therefore, the values given in the curriculum can be revised and the values which are transferred deficiently and inadequately can be involved more.
- ✓ The activity types related to values in books published by Meb and private publishing house can be varied.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This study was supported by the Commission of Scientific Research Projects in Ahi Evran University. (Proje no: PYO-EGF.4001.12.029)

REFERENCES

- Adıgüzel, A. (2010). İlköğretim okullarında öğretim teknolojilerinin durumu ve sınıf öğretmenlerinin bu teknolojileri kullanma düzeyleri. *Dicle University Ziya Gökalp Education Faculty Journal*, 15:1-17.
- Halstead, M. (1996). *Values and Values Education in Schools*. Values in Education and Education in Values (Editors :Halstead,J.,M.and Taylor,M.,J .) The Falmer Presy:London.
- Ho, H., Hsu, Y.(2011)Improving the Textbook Adoption Procesey in Taiwan, *International Education Studies* 4(4),ss:92-98 . <http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/ies.v4n4p92>
- MEB (2005). *İlköğretim Sosyal Bilgiler Dersi 6-7.Sınıflar Öğretim Programı ve Kılavuzu (Taslak Basım)*. The Board of Turkish Education of Ministry of Education, State Board on Books, Ankara.
- MEB (2008). *İlköğretim 7.Sınıf Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretmen Kılavuz Kitabı*. Gizem Publishing, Ankara.
- MEB (2010). *İlköğretim 6.Sınıf Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretmen Kılavuz Kitabı*. Gizem Publishing, Ankara
- MEB (2011). *İlköğretim 5.Sınıf Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretmen Kılavuz Kitabı*.Pasifik Publishing, Ankara
- MEB (2011). *İlköğretim 6.Sınıf Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretmen Kılavuz Kitabı*.Altın Publishing, Ankara
- MEB (2011). *İlköğretim 5.Sınıf Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretmen Kılavuz Kitabı*.Anıttepe Publishing, Ankara
- MEB(2012). *İlköğretim 5.Sınıf Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretmen Kılavuz Kitabı*. Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı Talim ve Terbiye Kurulu, Ankara.
- MEB (2012a). *İlköğretim 6.Sınıf Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretmen Kılavuz Kitabı*. The Board of Turkish Education of Ministry of Education, State Board on Books,Ankara.
- MEB (2012b). *İlköğretim 7.Sınıf Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretmen Kılavuz Kitabı*. The Board of Turkish Education of Ministry of Education, State Board on Books, Ankara.
- Özkan, R. (2010). Türk eğitim sisteminde himayeci değerler: İlköğretim ders kitapları örneği. *International Journal of Human Sciences* . 7(1),p:1124-1141. from <http://www.insanbilimleri.com/ojs/index.php/uib/article/view/816/536#.URwGiR2jeul>
- Sanchez, T.,R. (1998). *Heroes, Values, and Transcending Time: Using Trade Books to Teach Values*. www.eric.ed.gov, ERİC Document No: ED 426 923
- Sezer, Ö. (2005). *İlköğretim 1. Kademe Türkçe Ders KitaplarındaDeğerlerin İncelenmesi*. Master's Thesis. Marmara Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, İstanbul.
- Karaca, F.(2011) İlköğretim Öğretmenleri Derslerinde Ne Tür Öğretim Araç ve Gereçleri Kullanmaktadırlar? *Selçuk University, Ahmet Keleşoğlu Education Faculty Journal* , 32, p:131-148.
- Tillman, D.(2000). *Living Values Activities for Young Adults*. Living Value:A Educational Program. Health Communications, Inc.
- Yıldırım, A. ve Şimşek, H. (2003). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri*. (Tıpkı Basım 3.Baskı). Ankara: Seçkin Publishing.