

COMPARISON OF GENERAL MUSIC CULTURE OF CITIZENS LIVING IN NEIGHBOR METROPOLISES TRABZON/TURKEY AND BATUMI/GEORGIA

Işıl Güneş Modiri Dilek
isilmodiri@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

People's knowledge about classical world music, composers, performers and much known basic music concepts, constitute their general musical culture. This research was carried out in order to compare of the people's general musical cultures of two neighbouring cities: Trabzon/Turkey and Batumi/Georgia. The study's study group consisted of $n=20$ (10 + 10) randomly selected from the people living in the cities of Trabzon and Batumi, in the regions where the families from the middle socio-economic level reside. The research was a qualitative study and the interview form consisting of open-ended questions developed by the researcher was used for determining the general music cultures of the study group. The obtained data were analyzed by descriptive analysis. At the end of the research, the general music cultures of the people living in neighbouring cities "Trabzon and Batumi" from "Turkey and Georgia" had been compared via their answers and the results had been interpreted and made some evaluations.

Keywords: General Music Culture, Music Culture Comparison, Trabzon and Batumi, Turkey and Georgia

INTRODUCTION

Music has existed in every phase of human life since the time of man's existence. Music is not a luxury for man but an indispensable necessity. There is almost no one who does not have a place the music in his life. "In all stages of a person's life who is social, sound became an important stimulus from the moment men was born and the musical harmony, and beautiful sounds complement their spiritual existence" (Şen, 2016).

There isn't life without music. "In individual and community's life Music is one of the important area with the characteristics of being a cultural heritage with art direction and being a reflection of cultural identity"(Şen, 2016). According to the TDK dictionary, "Music is the art of describing certain feelings and thoughts in harmonious voices within the frame of certain rules." It is also described as "reading and playing of the works of composed voices arranged in this manner". Music has influenced the societies' culture and also the other cultures it has entered.

In other words, music and culture are in constant interaction. As a Society-Science term, culture is defined as "the whole of all the material and spiritual values created in the process of historical and social development and the means of measuring the sovereignty of man's natural and social environment which is used to create them and transmit them to the next generation" (İzzet Benice, cited: turkedebiyati.org) or "fullest extent of art works and thoughts foible to a community or a society" (Salah Birsal, cited: turkedebiyati.org).

When we consider culture as an individual term rather than as a society term, the following definitions prevail: "The form of reasoning, pleasure and criticism developed through learning and experiences" (Mehmet Kaplan, cited: Turkedebiyati.org), "emphasizes the importance of reasoning, criticism and appreciation learning, experimentation and experience", "knowledge that the individual earned in any field" (google dictionary). In this context, when we deal with the concept of "Music Culture" in an individual sense, we can define it as follows: "Knowledge acquired by the individual in the field of music" or "Musical appreciation, reasoning, criticism and development of knowledge through education, experimentation and experience". In this study, the "musical culture" was discussed as its individually meaning.

General Music Culture is generally similar in terms of common language, culture, religion and educational conditions for the people living in close geographical areas, but is it possible that the general musical cultures of people in two cities separated by borders (country boundaries) in terms of language, culture, religion and educational conditions differ from each other even though they are located in close geographical locations?

In order to answer this question, two neighbouring cities of Turkey and Georgia which are Trabzon and Batumi, were asked questions about music to compare their general music cultures.

Trabzon is a city established in Turkey, in the north-east of Eastern Anatolia, at the coast of a natural port of the Black Sea, at the beginning of the transit route to Asia and the Middle East. It is 41 degrees north latitude and 39

degrees 43 degrees east longitude. The surface area is 4685 km² (trabzonguldak6167.blogcu). The language of people who live in Trabzon is Turkish, religious is Islam.

Batumi is the capital city of Acara, an autonomous republic in Georgia, and the port city on the shores of the Black Sea. The geographical location of Batumi is 37 ° 32 '59 "North and 32 ° 45' 59" East gps coordinates. The surface is 64.9 km². The language of people who live in Batumi is Georgian; their religions are Islam and Orthodox Christians. The distance between these two cities is 205.9 km and it takes approximately 2 hours and 54 minutes by a car.

If we mention the history of the Trabzon briefly; Ionian originates the Miletus, after the Western Anatolia they came to the Black Sea in the 7th century BC. and established colonial cities on these coasts. Trabzon is also one of those colonies along with the capital city Sinop, and many researchers show this period as the first foundation of the city. When the Roman Empire was divided into two pieces in 395, Trabzon remained within the borders of the Eastern Roman / Byzantine Empire, which was central Istanbul. Muslim Arabs came to Eastern Black Sea and Trabzon in the raids they had organized in Anatolia since the beginning of 8th century. On the occasion of the Byzantine Empire's passing by the Latin in the 4th Crusade in 1204, Alexios and David, the descendants of Emperor I Andronicus Komnenos from Istanbul, and with the help of Georgian Queen Tamara, the Kingdom of Komnenos established independently in Trabzon in 1204. The Ottoman Forces under the leadership of Sultan Mehmed the Conqueror surrounded the region, conquered Trabzon in 1461 and ended the dominance of the Komnenos. The Russians conquered Trabzon on April 14, 1916, and remained dominant here for nearly two years. In 1917, the "Bolshevik Revolution" in Russia, the Tsarist regime was demolished. On top of that, there was a great panic in the Russian army. This leads to the withdrawal of the Russians from Trabzon. The Turkish Gangs descended to Akçaabat and walked towards Trabzon from three crews under the command of Captain Kahraman Bey and take Trabzon back on 24 February 1918 (trabzon.gov.tr).

If we look at the history of Georgia, people have been alive since ancient times in Georgia. B.C. In 65, Georgian bastions entered Rome domination. After accepting Christianity in 337, Georgia faced many battles between the Byzantine and Persian empires form ay years. Muslims conquered Tbilisi in 654 and established an emirate in the region. The second David took Tbilisi back from the Muslims. The boundaries of Georgia, which experienced its strongest period during the reign of Queen Tamara (1184-1213), extended from Azerbaijan to Circassia and from Erzurum to Gence. After a while, the country divided into principalities because to fighting each other. Ottoman armies entered the Imereti in 1510 and took over the capital city Kutaisi. With the Treaty of Georgievs securing the independence and territorial integrity of Georgia, the lands were under the protection of Russia (1783). In 1810 the Russians took over Imereti and then other small Georgian principalities. Batumi and Potty harbours under the Ottoman administration and the south-western lands were conquered by the Russians after the Ottoman-Russian harbours as a result. On 26 May 1918 Georgians established an independent state and accepted the German protection. When the Germans were defeated, the country was occupied by the British. The entente states actually recognized Georgia in January 1920. With the new adopted Constitution in 1936, Georgia became one of the 15 republics bringing the Soviet Union to the fray. Georgia declared its independence in 1991 and joined the Commonwealth of Independent States the same year (cografya.gen).

After declaring Georgia's independence, there have been serious social and economic changes in the country. These changes were reflected in the education as well as in all areas. An elderly citizen who is living in Batumi tells about these changes as:

"During the Soviet era, education was done more seriously and properly. Schools continued when the system collapsed, but there were irregularities as teacher salaries were not paid. In addition, absences from schools began. People started getting diplomas without going to school. Diplomas have been sold with money. It was a transition period. This situation lasted for 10 years. After 1991, education completely lost its quality. In the following years it started to improve slowly but new young people did not get a full education. Teachers were minus in the schools. They were also absent. Sale of diplomas with money has completely boosted the poor quality of education. Today, they are starting to recover. After 2004, serious education began again in schools. The current education is good.

The system changed and the people dropped into emptiness. During this period, all the factories in this region have closed down. Everyone lost their job. They did not own large land anyway. Agriculture was carried out by the state. When all these stopped, people fell into emptiness. During this period, everything has deteriorated. The quality deteriorated mainly for schools and education. Most people did not go to school. Everyone started looking for a way to earn their bread. Many people went to other countries such as Turkey and Russia and had a struggled life. This process continued until the Saakashvili revolution of 2004. A new formation began after

Saakashvili's entry. Everything has been rearranged and done properly. Education has gained importance again. But when we look at it, the old people are better educated and have a better general culture. The young people are very uneducated and uninformed. This is also the case for music. In the past there were different musical instruments or a piano in all houses. Now you can hardly see that. And most of them sold their pianos for bread. There were antique pianos. They even sold their guitars. Music, sports and other social activities were totally abandoned. The only issue was "How can I just earn my bread?". This was all because of the system. It will take a long time to recover from all of this. Maybe it will never be like the old times because the education here is based on the money. You must pay for a good school. There are also Turkish schools here. There are other foreign schools too like German Colleges. They also give education here. Some of the people will receive good education because they can pay and some will not receive a good education and quality will decrease in the whole society again. Those who get a good education in good schools will be elite, those who cannot, will remain uneducated."

In the light of the information given above, this study aims to compare the general music cultures by asking about music to the people who live in neighbouring metropolises Batumi and Trabzon, which are separated from each other by geographical boundaries.

AIM

This study was carried out with the aim of comparing the general musical cultures of the people living in two neighbouring cities Trabzon and Batumi from neighbouring countries Turkey and Georgia.

METHOD

Study Groups

The study's study group consisted of $n = 20$ (10 + 10) people randomly selected from the people living in the cities of Trabzon and Batumi, in the regions where the families from the middle socio-economic level reside.

Collecting Data

According to Günay (2006), "those who create music in the music art are composers. Those who give life to it are performers and listeners are in the consumer situation". For this reason, in order to measure the general musical culture of the study group, they were asked about world famous composers, performers and some very basic music terms. The obtained data were analyzed by descriptive analysis with a qualitative approach.

Analysis of Data

In this qualitative study, the answers of the study group to the open-ended questions developed by the researcher were tabled and interpreted. Descriptive analysis and content analysis approaches were used for the analysis of answers. According to Yıldırım and Şimşek (2000), the aim of descriptive analysis is to organize and interpret the obtained data for the readers. The aim of content analysis is to reach new associations and concepts among the collected data.

FINDINGS

In this section, the information about the study group and their answers were tabled and interpreted. In order to make it easier to understand, separate tables were created for the answers given to each question.

In the tables, abbreviations as "P" for participant, "B" for Batumi and "T" for Trabzon were used.

Table 1: Information on the cities, genders, ages and occupations of the participants

Participants	City	Sex	Age	Job
P1	Batumi	Male	47	Lawyer
P2	Batumi	Male	38	Religious Teacher
P3	Batumi	Male	61	Merchant
P4	Batumi	Male	51	Military Retired
P5	Batumi	Male	63	Retired Pilot
P6	Batumi	Male	58	Ship Master
P7	Batumi	Female	32	Restaurant Worker
P8	Batumi	Female	62	Lawyer
P9	Batumi	Female	21	Pharmacist
P10	Batumi	Female	40	Merchant

P1	Trabzon	Male	34	Computer Eng.
P2	Trabzon	Male	42	Marketing
P3	Trabzon	Male	39	Chemistry Eng.
P4	Trabzon	Male	37	Fisheries Technical Eng.
P5	Trabzon	Male	32	English teacher
P6	Trabzon	Male	48	Math teacher
P7	Trabzon	Female	44	Teacher
P8	Trabzon	Female	39	Engineer
P9	Trabzon	Female	40	Order Operator
P10	Trabzon	Female	36	Nurse

(P=Participant, B= Batumi, T= Trabzon)

As can be understood from Table 1; 10 people (6 males, 4 females) from each of the cities of Batumi and Trabzon, totally 20 people (12 males, 8 females) participated in this study. The average age of those who live in Batumi was 47.3, and those who live in Trabzon was 39.1. Since the study group was chosen randomly, the professions vary. When we look at the occupational groups in the table, it is seen that the study group was generally well educated and had good professions.

Table 2: Participants' knowledge and levels on musical performances

Question 1	Do you play any instruments? If yes, on which level ...
P1B, P2B, P3B, P6B, P7B, P8B, P9B	No
P4B	Guitar, in good level
P5B, P10B	Piano, a little
P1T, P3T, P4T, P6T, P7T, P8T, P9T	No
P2T	Flute, Beginner
P5T	Guitar, advanced
K10T	Clarinet - Lowest level

(P=Participant, B= Batumi, T= Trabzon)

According to Table 2, most of participants do not play any instrument (70%). A small proportion of participants (20%) can play an instrument at an initial level. (%10) of the participants specified that they play their instruments in advanced level. The results do not change when the participants from the two cities were compared.

Table 3: Information on participants' recognition of world famous composers

Question 2	Could you name a world famous composer? Do you know which period this composer lived in?	True (T) False (F) No Answer (NA)
P1B	Joseph Verdi, Romantic	T, T
P2B, P7B	----, ----	NA, NA
P3B	Zülfü Livaneli, Contemporary	F, F
P4B	Katie Melua, Contemporary	T, T
P5B	Beethoven, 17th Century	T, F
P6B	Tchaikovsky, about 100 years ago	T, T
P8B	Beethoven, in1700's	T, F
P9B	Nika Lenina, Contemporary	F, F
P10B	İllya Bakanidze, Contemporary Compeser and Pianist	F, F
P1T	Mozart, 19th Century	T, F
P2 T	Mozart, 19th Century	T, F
P3 T	----, ----	NA, NA
P4 T	Beethoven, ----	T, NA
P5 T	Bach, baroque period	T, T
P6 T	Mozart, 18th Century	T, T

P7 T	Beethoven, 16th Century	T, F
P8 T	Beethoven, in 1800's	T, T
P9 T	Mozart, ----	T, NA
P10T	Beethoven, in1800's	T, T

(P=Participant, B= Batumi, T= Trabzon)

When Table 3 is examined, participants living in Batumi responded 40% correct and 40% wrong answers to the questions about world famous composers. 20% did not answer. Participants living in Trabzon answered the questions 65% correctly and 15% wrongly. 20% did not answer. From here it can be concluded that the participants from Trabzon have more information about the world famous composers.

Table 4: Information on participants' recognition of the world's famous orchestra conductors

Question 3	Could you say the name of a famous orchestra conductor living in our age? Where's this conductor from?	True (T) False (F) No Answer (NA)
P1B, P2B, P3B, P4B, P5B, P6B, P7B, P9B	----, ----	NA, NA
P8B	Cansul Kaxidze, Contemporary Georgian	T, T
K10B	Cansul Kaxidze, Contemporary Georgian	T, T
K1T	Rengim Gökmen, Turkish	T, T
K2T	Hikmet Şimşek, Turkish	T, T
K3T, K4T, K7T, K8T, K9T, K10T	----, ----	NA, NA
K5T	Gustavo Dudamel, Venezuela	T, T
K6T	Cem İdiz, ----	F, NA

(P=Participant, B= Batumi, T= Trabzon)

When Table 4 is examined, participants living in Batumi responded correctly to the questions by 20%. 80% of them did not answer. Participants living in Trabzon answered the questions correctly by 30% and wrong answers by 5%. 65% of them did not answer. It is understood from the results that the participants in Trabzon have a better general culture of recognizing orchestra conductors.

Table 5: Information on participants' recognition of world famous performers

Question 4	Could you name a world famous pianist or violinist? Do you know in which period this artist lived in?	True (T) False (F) No Answer (NA)
P1B	Sviatoslav Richter, Contemporary	T, T
P2 B	Khatia Buniatishvili, Contemporary	T, T
P3 B	İdil Biret, Contemporary	T, T
P4 B	Elisso Bolkvadze, Contemporary	T, T
P5 B	Eliso Viltzaladze, Contemporary Violinist	F, F
P6 B	Liana İsakadze, Contemporary Georgian Violinist	T, T
P7B, P9B	----, ----	NA, NA
P8 B	Liana İsakadze, Contemporary Georgian Violinist	T, T
P10B	Vanessa, Contemporary Violinist	T, T
P1T, P3T, P4T	----, ----	NA, NA
P2T	Fazıl Say, Contemporary	T, T
P5T	Martha Argerich, Contemporary	T, T
P6T	Fazıl Say- 21th Century	T, T
P7T	İdil Biret, Contemporary	T, T
P8T	Fazıl Say, in1900's	T, F
P9T	Fazıl Say, Contemporary	T, T
P10T	Fazıl Say- 20th Century	T, F

(P=Participant, B= Batumi, T= Trabzon)

When Table 5 is examined, most of the participants (70%) living in Batumi responded correctly to the questions about the world famous composer / pianist. 10% of the participants gave wrong answers to the question and

20% left the question unanswered. Likewise, most of the participants in Trabzon responded correctly (60%) to the related questions. 10% of the respondents gave wrong answers to the question and 30% left the question unanswered.

It is understood from the table that the participants living in Batumi are better acquainted with the world famous music performers. However, if we do make comparisons, participants from both cities answered this question truly at a high level. On the other hand, participants from both countries seem to know the names of the performers coming out of their own countries. In this context can be said that the most known pianists in Turkey were "İdil Biret and Fazıl say" and the most famous violinist in Georgia was "Liana Isakadze".

Table 6: Information about participants' recognition of the world's famous sopranos

Question 5	Could you name a world famous soprano?	True (T) False (F) No Answer (NA)
P1B, P2B, P3B, P6B, P9B, P10B	----	NA
P4B	Pavarotti	F
P5B	Montserrat Caballe	T
P7B	Pavarotti	F
P8B	Pavarotti	F
P1T, P2T, P3T, P6T, P7T, P8T, P10T	----	NA
P4T	Pavarotti	F
P5T	Sarah Brightman	T
P9T	Pavarotti	F

(P=Participant, B= Batumi, T= Trabzon)

According to Table 6, 60% of participants in Batumi did not know the meaning of Soprano.30% answered this question incorrectly and only 10% of the participants answered this question correctly. Similarly70% of the participants in Trabzon did not answer the question about the meaning of Soprano. 20% gave wrong answer to the question and only 10% of the respondents answered the question correctly.

Comparing the percentages of the answers given by the participants from the two cities, it is understood that the participants living in the cities of Batumi and Trabzon have little or no knowledge of the world famous singers. It is thought that since they didn't know the term of "Soprano" is a terminology related to the female voice, they gave male voice artists names as the answer. Another result that can be infer from the answers is that "Luciano Pavarotti" is the most known opera artist by people from both cities.

Table 7: Participants' responses to the definition of "Soprano"

Question 6	What does Soprano mean?	True (T) False (F) No Answer (NA)
P1B, P2B, P3B, P7 B	----	NA
P4 B	A type of voice	T
P5 B	Female Voice	T
P6 B	It means singer	F
P8 B	It's a kind of music.	F
P9 B	Human Voice	F
P10B	Opera singer	F
P1T, P3T, P4T, P6T, P7T, P8T, P10T	----	NA
P2T	High Voice	T
P5T	The highest Female Voice	T
P9T	High Voice	T

(P=Participant, B=Batumi, T= Trabzon)

When Table 7 is examined, it is seen that only 20% of the participants living in Batumi respond correctly to the question. While 40% of the participants were unable to answer the question, 40% answered the question incorrectly. Considering the answers from Trabzon, it is seen that 70% of the participants couldn't answer the question. 30% of the respondents answered the question correctly. When we compare the answers of both cities,

it is seen that participants living in Trabzon know a little more the term of "Soprano", but when we consider the percentages, we can say that the participants living in Batumi and Trabzon have little or no knowledge about general music terms.

Table 8: Answers given by participants about the definition of music

Question 7	What you can say about music?
P1B	Good music is good. I like it if it's relaxing.
P2 B	Music is the power of God.
P3 B	I like music that expresses people problems. Like folk music.
P4 B	It is a report from the space that comes to man's mind.
P5 B	Music is like heaven.
P6 B	Music requires mastery and it makes human happy.
P7 B	It is something that relaxes the human.
P8 B	Music is the friend of a person. If a person likes music, he cannot leave it. If someone loves music, music loves him too. It's such a great love that all people are dealing with it all over the world.
P9 B	I like music.
P10B	The art of music, like art in painting and writing, is something that can go back towards God.
P1T	No life without music.
P2T	Music is the balance of life.
P3T	Sounds pleasant to the ear.
P4 T	Music is beautiful.
P5T	I see music as a passion that brings incredible emotion to the human being.
P6T	Listen to something perfect.
P7T	It is a science that restores a person's soul, adds colour, and reveals what exists in nature.
P8T	I don't have very much information.
P9T	Music is a part of life and it's perfect.
P10T	I want to say a lot but I don't have knowledge enough. Music is breath, peace and civilization.

(P=Participant, B= Batumi, T= Trabzon)

When Table 8 is examined, it is understood that all the participants say good things about music and love music. Participants living in Batumi have also touched on the artistic and divine aspect of music and defined music mostly as relaxing, happy, expressing problems, friend of human. Participants living in Trabzon have defined music as beautiful, relaxing, peacefulness, need and emotions.

CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSION

The concept of "Music Culture" can be defined both in terms of social and individual meaning. We can define music cultures in individual sense as "knowledge acquired by the individual in the field of music" or "development of musical tastes, reasoning, criticism and knowledge through education, experimentation and experiences". In this study, term of musical culture was discussed individually. In order to test and compare the music related general knowledge and cultures of the citizens living in the cities of Batumi and Trabzon, the open-ended questions which developed by the researcher, were asked to the people the answers given by the participants were interpreted and the following conclusions were reached:

In Georgia and Turkey, 10 out of every two big cities in Batumi and Trabzon which separated by geographical borders, participated in the study. The average age of those who participated in Batumi is 47.3, and those who participated in Trabzon are 39.1. The participants' professions vary.

Most participants do not play any instruments (70%). A small part of participants (20%) can play an instrument at beginners level. Ten percent of the participants said they play the instrument well. The results do not change when the participants in the two cities are compared.

When the chart (table) 3 is examined, participants living in Batumi responded 40% correctly of the questions about famous composers while participants living in Trabzon answered 65% correctly of it. From this, it can be concluded that the participants of Trabzon have more knowledge about the world famous composers.

When the chart (table) 4 is examined, 20% of the participants living in Batumi answered to questions about orchestra conductors correctly while 30% of participants living in Trabzon could not answer it correctly. It is understood from this that the participants in Trabzon have overall a better culture of recognizing orchestra chefs. It can be considered that people who live in Trabzon get this information on the TV they watch, because it emphasize some orchestra chefs especially. Rengim Gökmen and Hikmet Şimşek are well known orchestra chefs in Turkey.

From the answers given, it is understood that most of the participants who live in Batumi (70%) answered correctly to the questions about the world famous composer / pianist. Likewise, most of the participants who live in Trabzon answered (60%) correctly to the related questions. It is understood that the participants living in Batumi have better knowledge about the world famous music performers. On the other hand, participants from both countries seem to know the names of the performers from their own countries. In this regard, It can be said that the most known pianists in Turkey are "İdil Biret" and "Fazıl say"; the most famous violinist in Georgia is "Liana Isakadze".

According to chart (table) 6, only 10% of the participants living in Batumi have been able to name a world famous soprano. The situation of the participants living in Trabzon did not change. As the participants do not know that the term "Soprano" is a terminology related to female voice (See Table 7), it is seen that they answered the question with a male voice artist's name which is "Luciano Pavarotti".

It is understood that all participants like music and say good things about it. Participants living in Batumi have also mentioned on the artistic and divine aspects of music while defining music as more relaxing, happy, expressing problems, making friends. Participants living in Trabzon have defined music more like; beauty, comforting, giving peace, as a need and waking up the emotions.

Generally speaking, two metropolitan cities of neighbouring countries, Batumi and Trabzon, answered the questions about General Music Culture in a similar level. Although the percentage by a narrow margin is higher of the correct answers of participants who live in Trabzon, this percentage is so low that we cannot say that the participants of Trabzon have higher general music culture. The answers given about the world famous composers, performers and the very basic terminologies, it is thought that the knowledge of people on this matter are based on by living and not obtained by reading the information on these topics. It is thought that it is because of the inadequate music education given by the schools.

The participants who play the instrument at a good level gave better answers to the questions; in this case it shows that instrument trainings contributed to their General Music Culture.

When the ages and their answers of the participants in Batumi are examined, it is understood that the older citizens who are educated while living under the Soviet Union have a higher level general culture of music than the young citizens who have recently studied. This is thought to be due to the economic and educational problems after declaring Georgia's independence.

As a result, it is considered that, general music cultures will increase in both countries if music education can be improved in schools, opportunities to go to the concerts can be provide, and instrument education can be extend.

REFERENCES

- GÜNAY, Edip (2006). *Müzik Sosyolojisi Sosyolojiden Müzik Kültürüne Bir Bakış*, İstanbul: Bağlam Yayıncılık.
- Şen, Ü. S. (2016). THE CONCEPT MUSIC AESTHETIC ON THE BASIS OF MAN AND SOCIETY, The Journal of International Social Research, www.sosyalarastirmalar.com, Cilt: 9 Sayı: 45 Volume: 9 Issue: 45
- Yıldırım, A. & şimşek, H. (2000). *Sosyal Bilimlerde Nitel Araştırma Teknikleri*, Ankara: Seçkin Yayınevi.
<http://www.cografya.gen.tr> (Access Date 14.09.2017)
www.google.com.tr(Access Date 22.09.2017)
<http://www.tdk.gov.tr> (Access Date 02.10.2017)
<http://www.trabzon.gov.tr> (Access Date 15.09.2017)
<http://trabzonguldak6167.blogcu.com> (Access Date 02.09.2017)
www.turkedebiyati.org (Access Date 22.09.2017)